

Treadway, Diane (Mayor's Office)

From: Gossage, Jeff L (Finance - Procurement)
Sent: Monday, October 17, 2016 12:39 PM
To: Riebeling, Richard (Mayor's Office)
Cc: Treadway, Diane (Mayor's Office); McDoniel, Kim (Finance - Director's Office); Nolan, Gene (Finance - Director's Office)
Subject: A&E Mayoral Selection Request for RFQ 941587, Development Engineering Services

Metro received seven (7) proposals for the A&E Review Board to consider. The Review Board submits for review and selection by the Mayor the top three (3) evaluated firms listed below in alphabetical order, accompanied by the Review Board's summary.

While it is acknowledged that the selection is solely that of the Mayor, it is the Review Board's recommendation that **Ragan-Smith Associates Inc.** be considered for this project.

Barge Waggoner Sumner and Cannon, Inc

Strengths: Workflow process outlined in methodology/business plan; depth of prime firms capacity and Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses: Some key individuals' resumes were note one-page format; project manager lacked experience; failed to demonstrate experience on indefinite

delivery/indefinite quantity type contracts; and subconsultants' capacity.

MWBE Plan: Proposed the engagement of Booker Engineering for electrical engineering services; K.S. Ware & Associates for geotechnical engineering and material testing services; and Varallo Public Relations for stake holder involvement.

SBE/SDV Plan: Pledged 20% SBE/SDV over life of the project. Proposed the engagement of Booker Engineering for electrical engineering services; K.S. Ware & Associates for geotechnical engineering and material testing services; and Varallo Public Relations for stake holder involvement. (Booker Engineering, K.S. Ware & Associates, and Varallo Public Relations are also MWBEs).

LittleJohn Engineering

Strengths: Demonstrated commercial development experience; demonstrated a clear understanding of scope of services; and Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses: Failed to demonstrate any innovative and cost savings approaches; litigations; staffing availability; utility relocation approaches lacked detail; and failed to demonstrate experience on indefinite delivery/indefinite quantity type contracts.

MWBE Plan: Proposed the engagement of Booker Engineering for lighting services; Varallo Public Relations for public relation services; and Geotek Engineering for geotechnical engineering services.

SBE/SDV Plan: Pledged 20% SBE/SDV over life of the project. Proposed the engagement of Booker Engineering for lighting services; Varallo Public Relations for public relation

Ragan-Smith Associates Inc.



Strengths: Strong specialized expertise of team members; demonstrate various project of similar size, scope, and complexity; Methodology/Business Plan demonstrate a strong understanding of scope of work and Metro processes; demonstrate ability to handle multiple projects under contract simultaneously; Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses: N/A

MWBE Plan: Proposed the engagement of K.S. Ware & Associates for environmental, geotechnical, CEI, EPSC, laboratory/testing; Varallo Public Relations for public outreach, public meetings, media relations; and Wilmot, Inc. for cost estimation, sustainability, engineering support, benefit-cost analysis, certification, recycling, green building and infrastructure.

SBE/SDV Plan: Pledged 20% SBE/SDV over life of the project. Proposed the engagement of K.S. Ware & Associates for environmental, geotechnical, CEI, EPSC, laboratory/testing; Varallo Public Relations for public outreach, public meetings, media relations; and Wilmot, Inc. for cost estimation, sustainability, engineering support, benefit-cost analysis, certification, recycling, green building and infrastructure. (K.S. Ware & Associates, Varallo Public Relations, and Wilmot are also MWBEs).

Jeff L. Gossage, C.P.M.
Purchasing Agent
Metropolitan Government of Nashville & Davidson County
615-862-6639 Office
Jeff.Gossage@Nashville.gov

Metro
Procurement Nashville

RFQ # 941587 – Development Engineering Services

Offeror	Barge Waggoner Sumner and Cannon, Inc	Civil & Environmental Consultants, Inc.	Civil Site Design Group, PLLC	DBS & Associates Engineering, Inc.	LittleJohn Engineering	Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc	Ragan-Smith Assoc Inc.
Specialized Expertise of Team Members (25 Points)	21	18	15	19	19	19	24
Methodology / Business Plan (35 Points)	30	29	25	31	31	29	34
Similar Project Experience (25 Points)	22	20	18	19	20	20	24
Capacity to Perform (15 Points)	13	12	10	10	11	12	14
Total Evaluation Scores	86	79	68	79	81	80	96

Barge Waggoner Sumner and Cannon, Inc

Strengths – Workflow process outlined in methodology/business plan; depth of prime firms capacity and Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses – Some key individuals’ resumes were note one-page format; project manager lacked experience; failed to demonstrate experience on indefinite delivery/indefinite quantity type contracts; and subconsultants’ capacity.

Civil & Environmental Consultants, Inc.

Strengths – Sidewalk experience of team members; Corrective action planning experience; Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses – Project experience lacks in similar size, scope, and complexity; methodology/business plan was generic and lacks information concerning traffic engineering as it relates to developments; litigations and license violations; and staffing availability.

Civil Site Design Group, PLLC

Strengths – Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses – Failed to identify project manager; failed to provide response to current litigations and licensing violations; failed to demonstrate any innovative and cost savings approaches; failed to demonstrate experience on indefinite delivery/indefinite quantity type contracts; failed to demonstrate staff availability; and overall proposal lacked detail.

DBS & Associates Engineering, Inc.

Strengths – Strong specialized expertise of subconsultant team members; Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses - failed to demonstrate experience on indefinite delivery/indefinite quantity type contracts; methodology/business plan lacked how the work was going to be done; similar project experience demonstrated was not of similar complexity; and smaller capacity compared to other firms.

RFQ # 941587 – Development Engineering Services

Offeror	Barge Waggoner Sumner and Cannon, Inc	Civil & Environmental Consultants, Inc.	Civil Site Design Group, PLLC	DBS & Associates Engineering, Inc.	LittleJohn Engineering	Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc	Ragan-Smith Assoc Inc.
Specialized Expertise of Team Members (25 Points)	21	18	15	19	19	19	24
Methodology / Business Plan (35 Points)	30	29	25	31	31	29	34
Similar Project Experience (25 Points)	22	20	18	19	20	20	24
Capacity to Perform (15 Points)	13	12	10	10	11	12	14
Total Evaluation Scores	86	79	68	79	81	80	96

LittleJohn Engineering

Strengths – Demonstrated commercial development experience; demonstrated a clear understanding of scope of services; and Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses – Failed to demonstrate any innovative and cost savings approaches; litigations; staffing availability; utility relocation approaches lacked detail; and failed to demonstrate experience on indefinite delivery/indefinite quantity type contracts.

Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc

Strengths – Utility and CEI approaches of proposal; Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses – Prime firm lacks specialized expertise; failed to demonstrate project experience of similar scope and complexity; litigations; and methodology/business plan lacked detail as it relates to subdivisions.

Ragan-Smith Assoc Inc.

Strengths – Strong specialized expertise of team members; demonstrate various project of similar size, scope, and complexity; Methodology/Business Plan demonstrate a strong understanding of scope of work and Metro processes; demonstrate ability to handle multiple projects under contract simultaneously; Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses – N/A

BAO SBE Assessment Sheet

BAO Specialist: JoeAnn Carr
Contract Specialist: Terri Troup
Date: 08/22/16
Department Name: Public Works
RFP/ITB Number: 941587
Project Name: Development Engineering Services

Primary Contractor	SBE/SDV Requirement Acknowledged?	Comments
Barge Waggoner Sumner and Cannon, Inc	Yes	Barge Waggoner Sumner and Cannon, Inc proposes: Booker Engineering for electrical engineering services as required by individual task orders, K.S. Ware & Associates for geotechnical engineering and material testing as required by individual task orders, Varallo Public Relations for stakeholder involvements as required by individual task orders
Littlejohn Engineering Associates, Inc.	Yes	Littlejohn Engineering Associates, Inc. proposes: Booker Engineering for lighting services, Varallo Public Relations for public relations services, and Geotek Engineering for geotechnical services, Weatherford and Associates for land surveying
RAGAN-SMITH ASSOC INC (P#)	Yes	RAGAN-SMITH ASSOC INC (P#) proposes: K.S. Ware and Associates for environmental, geotechnical, CEI, EPSC, Laboratory/testing; Varallo Public Relations for public outreach, public meetings, media relations; Wilmot, Inc. for cost estimation, sustainability, engineering support, benefit-cost analyses, certification, recycling, green building and infrastructure

PNP Compliance Results Form

Department Name: Metro Public Works

RFP/ITB Number: 941587

Procurement Name: Development Engineering Services

Primary Contractor	PNP Compliant (Yes/No)	Determination Comments/% of Participation Proposed or Bid
Barge Waggoner Sumner and Cannon, Inc	Yes	Barge Waggoner Sumner and Cannon, Inc successfully completed the GFE outreach to three certified MWBEs and propose: Booker Engineering for electrical engineering services as required by individual task orders K.S. Ware & Associates for geotechnical engineering and material testing as required by individual task orders, Varallo Public Relations for stakeholder involvement as required by individual task orders
Littlejohn Engineering Associates, Inc.	Yes	Littlejohn Engineering Associates, Inc. successfully completed the GFE outreach to three certified MWBEs and propose: Booker Engineering for lighting services, Varallo Public Relations for public relations services, and Geotek Engineering for geotechnical services
RAGAN-SMITH ASSOC INC (P#)	Yes	RAGAN-SMITH ASSOC INC (P#) successfully completed the GFE outreach to three certified MWBEs and propose: K.S. Ware and Associates for environmental, geotechnical, CEI, EPSC, Laboratory/testing; Varallo Public Relations for public outreach, public meetings, media relations; Wilmot, Inc. for cost estimation, sustainability, engineering support, benefit-cost analyses, certification, recycling, green building and infrastructure

*Denotes Contractor with whom follow up was required

Date: 08/22/16

Metro Buyer: Terri Troup

BAO Rep: JoeAnn Carr